EXAMINING THE EFFECTS OF ENGAGEMENT:

High-Impact Practices & Student Flourishing

Ashley Finley, Ph.D
Senior Director of Assessment & Research, AAC&U
National Evaluator, Bringing Theory to Practice
Webster University
Global Citizenship Program Collaboratory
May 19, 2014
Common High-Impact Practices:

- FYS & Experiences
- Common Intellectual Experiences
- Learning Communities
- Writing Intensive
- Collaborative Assignments
- Undergraduate Research
- Diversity/Global Learning
- Service Learning, CBL
- Internships
- Capstone Courses & Projects

How many of these are you doing? Why?
Developing an Inquiry-Based Model

1) Who participates?
2) What are the effects of participation in specific experiences?
3) What are the effects of participation in multiple activities?
   - Compared to students in the same group who do not participate?
   - Compared to students in other groups that do participate?
4) How do students describe these experiences?
How “high-impact”? And for whom?
(Tia McNair, senior director for student success, Co-PI)

- Data from 38 institutions (CA, OR, WI)
- NSSE data from 2006-2008 (one year of data from each campus)
- HIPs examined
  - Learning Communities
  - Service learning
  - Study Abroad
  - Internship
  - Capstone
  - Student/Fac. Res.
  - 0-6 experiences
- 20,000+ students
  - First Year = 36.5%, SR = 51.1% (included Soph., Jr, Unclassified)
  - Transfer = 33%
  - First-generation = 51%
- Race
  - White = 58.7%
  - African American = 2.5%
  - Asian American = 11.8%
  - Hispanic = 13.2%
  - (Other = 6.2%, No Response = 7.5%)
Who participates in HIPs?

- Overall students participated in 1.3 HIPs experiences
- Non first-generation students participate in more HIPs than first-generation (1.5 vs. 1.2)
- Transfer students participate in more HIPs than non-transfer (1.5 vs. 1.2)
- White students participate in more HIPs than Asian American and Hispanic students (1.4 vs 1.3 & 1.2, respectively)
  - No difference bet. White and African American students
What are the effects of participation in certain high-impact experiences?

What are the effects of participation in multiple high-impact experiences?
Outcomes Examined

- **Deep Learning** = Pursuit of learning beyond memorization to seek underlying meanings & relationships
- **Gains in General Education** = Writing/speaking skills, acquire broad general educ, analyzing quant. probs
- **Gains in Practical Competence** = Work related knowledge & skills, working effectively w/ others, use of technology, quant. problem-solving, solving complex real-world problems
- **Gains in Personal & Social Development** = Developing ethics, understanding diff. bkgrds, understanding self, contributing to community, voting
HIP Participation vs. No Participation: Avg. Boost Across All Outcomes

- Learning Com: +7.7pts
- Serv Learn.: +8.5pts
- Study Abr: +4.2pts
- Internship: +5.2pts
- St/Fac Res: +8.1pts
- Capstone: +6.1pts
Effect of participation in *Multiple* HIPs on Outcomes

- Deep Learning
  - No HIPs: 51
  - 1-2 HIPs: 57
  - 3-4 HIPs: 64
  - 5-6 HIPs: 71

- Gains Gen. Ed.
  - No HIPs: 64
  - 1-2 HIPs: 69
  - 3-4 HIPs: 74
  - 5-6 HIPs: 71

- Gains Practical
  - No HIPs: 58
  - 1-2 HIPs: 65
  - 3-4 HIPs: 70
  - 5-6 HIPs: 76

- Gains Pers. & Soc.
  - No HIPs: 43
  - 1-2 HIPs: 50
  - 3-4 HIPs: 57
  - 5-6 HIPs: 67

Standardized Scores (0-100)
What is the effect of participation in multiple HIPs relative to students in the same group who do NOT participate?
Avg % Increase in Outcomes w/ Participation in Multiple HIPs Vs. No Participation (by First-Generation & Transfer Status)

- 1-2 HIPs
  - First-Gen: 11%
  - Transfer: 24%

- 3-4 HIPs
  - First-Gen: 24%
  - Transfer: 14%

- 5-6 HIPs
  - First-Gen: 35%
  - Transfer: 26%

- 1-2 HIPS
- 3-4 HIPS
- 5-6 HIPS
Avg % Increase in Outcomes w/ Participation in Multiple HIPs Vs. No Participation (by Race)

- **Afr. Amer**
  - 1-2 HIPs: 11%
  - 3-4 HIPs: 27%
  - 5-6 HIPs: 47%

- **Asian Amer**
  - 1-2 HIPs: 21%
  - 3-4 HIPs: 23%
  - 5-6 HIPs: 21%

- **Hispanic**
  - 1-2 HIPs: 10%
  - 3-4 HIPs: 10%
  - 5-6 HIPs: 17%

- **White**
  - 1-2 HIPs: 12%
  - 3-4 HIPs: 25%
  - 5-6 HIPs: 37%
What are the comparative effects of participation in multiple HIPs for different groups of students?
Participation by Race: Deep Learning

![Graph showing participation by race across different HIPs levels.](image-url)
Participation by Race: Gains in Gen Ed

The graph shows the participation rates for different races (White, Afr.Am., AsianAm., and Hisp.) across different levels of HIPs (0, 1-2, 3-4, 5-6). The participation rates increase with the number of HIPs for all races, indicating gains in general education.
In Their Own Words: What Matters To Students…

- **15** focus groups
- **3** campuses/state (9 campuses total)
- **91** students

Focus Grp Characteristics:
- **48** first-generation
- **40** transfer
- **46** low-income
- **28** Hispanics
- **24** African-Americans
- **14** Multi-racial
- **11** Asian-Americans
- **9** Caucasians
- **4** Native Americans
- **1** Arab-American
“...I have teachers that take us out of the building. I don't know what it's called. It's called--it's called something here. They take you out of the building, and you go learn about like the vegetable gardens that they have growing here, among the Hmong society...So there's a lot of professors here that teach differently.”

Student, Wisconsin

- Expectations set at appropriately high levels
- Sig. investment of time & effort
- Interactions w/ faculty & peers
- Experiences with diversity
- Freq., constructive feedback
- Periodic, structured opportunities to reflect & integrate
- Relevance through real-world applications
- Public demonstration of competence

Source: Kuh & O'Donnell, 2013, Ensuring Quality and Taking High-Impact Practices to Scale. AAC&U
“I was in a learning community, that’s what they called it. All the students who were in that English and public speaking class. So twice a week we had class…we were in the same room from 8-10:45 every Monday and Wednesday…We had group work, we’d present our speeches and we’d look over their English stuff, so we were comfortable with each other by the end of the semester. We were just used to being around each other.”
Collaborative Assignments:
Public demonstration of competence

“I think projects with real world implications. I was really lucky enough to have more than a couple of classes where we did group work, where the outcomes of our projects at the end of the term made a real world difference where we were working at the nonprofit, at the library, and all the research that we did actually went to publication. All of the systems that we had researched and designed actually went someplace and that was incredible.”
“I thought, you know, from high school, I knew how to do an essay. So I was all gung ho, I'm like, yeah, so I'm getting in all done. I turned it in, and they're like, nah, wrong, go back and try again, and then try adding this. So I'm like, okay, so I started adding more. Next thing I knew I got a six-page essay with seven drafts, and then I turned it back in, and they're like you don't have a thesis. I thought I did. No, this is what a thesis is supposed to look like. So now I'm like, you know, essay ten, finally getting it drafted to turn in. I mean it was, it was a learning experience for me, and the way she done it, it made it to where, okay, hey, I want to do better. I mean she gave me positive feedback. She actually gave me the material that I was not presented with in high school. So I was actually able to go out, do my studies and do my research, and do what needed to be done to get my essays done.”
"I'm doing two capstones because I'm getting the two degrees. One of them I did at another university. I got to do a summer research experience, and that was, that was huge for me not just in, you know, I got to work with really great hardware. I got to work with an electron microscope. I got to work with really nice hardware that we don't necessarily get access to, but the largest part of that for me, if I'm working on imaging on an electron microscope, you can give me a class on that, you can talk to me about accelerating voltage, you can talk to me about how the electron interacts with this thing or that thing, but you sit down on this thing, and the image doesn't work. The picture looks horrible. I can't see what it is I'm supposed to see. So I got to go read this book. I've got to go work out these equations. I've got to go figure out all of this stuff. And I get this real understanding that came from trying to solve a problem first, and so then I get real in-depth, applied understanding, and then I understand why it is I'm learning this. Why am I looking at this stuff in this book? Why should I care about this stuff? It doesn't seem like it would apply to anything, and you find out it really does."
“I think I've grown a lot more accepting of like different people through like different organizations because I mean you go to like an organization, like I would have never thought this person would have been interested in this or anything like that, and I think I kind of, not to say that I was like more ignorant before I came to the situation, but it's kind of like there's just so many different walks of life around campus, there's so many people in the community, and then here, that you just kind of are pushed into, especially when you have classes where you have discussions, you're pushed into conversations with people that have a completely different background than you and completely different points of view. And I think it's really, you kind of grow, like your maturity grows a little more because you have to, you have to accept their views…”
“I recently, well, last term, I took a, uh, it was an anthropology class and it was uh, water systems… eh… good class. And the research project I chose was a little creek around here, and this little creek used to be horribly polluted… like bad, bad, bad, it stank. It’s not that way today. But I got to go out and find out that there are actually people who care, people trying to make a real difference for the whole world- city workers and blah, blah, blah, but I got to interview these people and talk with them and it changed my perspective on the world. You know it’s like, ‘it’s hopeless, it doesn’t really matter, we’re all going to die, it’s too far gone…’ There’s people who care and are trying to make differences, however small. I was amazed at the willingness of these people to talk to me for a silly little research paper, but they had passion and wanted to talk about this stuff… and it was cool.”
What Outcomes Might We Be Missing?

It's like a joy that comes over you because all of a sudden you're studying, and you're going over it, and you're going over it, and all of a sudden, it's like a light comes on…

I'm usually pretty excited and passionate about it, and when I go home and do my homework, I'm really enjoying it so I think the joy really tells you're liking it and engaged.

…I'm not only motivated by…how I can fix [something] for myself, and…how I can make the world better just solely by myself, but …more so how I can do that and help…other people so they can also see the benefit so we can benefit each other…as a whole. And I think that's…what motivates me. It's just like wholesome goodness.
Liberal Education & Whole Student Development

John Dewey →

Liberal Education = Freeing of the mind, civic connection, in addition to skills that enable students to deal with complex problems

“To find out what one is fitted to do, and to secure an opportunity to do it, is the key to happiness.”
“...and the pursuit of happiness”

Higher Education

Increased Knowledge & Intellectual Skills
- Critical thinking, communication skills, info literacy, quantitative literacy

Civic Capacity Building
- Ethical reasoning, Intercultural Competence, Civic-mindedness, Social justice

Individual Growth & Development
- Happiness, Satisfaction...
- Self-confidence, Resilience, Sense of purpose, Connection

Individual Growth & Development
- Self-confidence, Resilience, Sense of purpose, Connection
What Does It Mean to Flourish?

- Flourishing Scale (Corey Keyes, Emory University)
  - Positive emotions
    - Satisfaction with life
    - Happy with life
    - Interest in life
  - Positive psychological functioning
    - Self acceptance
    - Personal growth
    - Autonomy
    - Purpose in life
  - Positive social connections
    - Social contribution, integration, growth, interest, acceptance

“You’re asking people to be involved. They love that – it’s part of our human nature. People want to be asked to do something bigger than themselves.” Jane Kleeb (Bold Nebraska Initiative)
High-Impact Practices & Flourishing: What We Are Learning

- **Bringing Theory to Practice**
  - 300 funded campuses over 10 years
  - Engaged learning, civic development and psychosocial well-being
- **Connections between students’ civic engagement and flourishing**
  - Campus-based studies (Tufts, Wagner, St Lawrence, University of Denver, Dickinson College)
- **Connection between increased sense of civic commitment and flourishing**
  - Personal and Social Responsibility Inventory (PSRI) – multi-campus study
- **Psychosocial Well-Being Initiative (2013-2015)**
  - 29 institutions
  - Connections between various interventions and indicators of student well-being and development
I can do this.

I think on a more personal note, it made me realize that, that um, I grew up thinking that I couldn't be here, but here I am now doing all this, and so it made me realize my self-worth, and that I could ask abstract questions, and I could go out and find answers to them, and then tell other people about it who are also wondering the same thing that I'm wondering.
I am empowered.

A sense of accomplishment, which is also empowering, because you kind of rise and fall on your own work when you're out there in college. There is no organization or professor to hold your hand and doing certain of these things on your own let's you know that you can do that or you keep--it forces you to be resourceful because you can't help anybody unless you can actually do it yourself in the first place. So I think it really was good empowerment of knowing I can do this. This is what I'm capable of, and having that awareness gives you the courage to do other things and keep moving.
I can contribute.

And it helps give you a sense of self-worth so that way it's not just, hey, I got to do something; it's I want to do something, and I want to make a difference in the world.
Those activities provide relationships, and a lot of the time, especially with professors, you build a nice personal relationship, and then they can guide you beyond just that class and help you and, you know, beyond, beyond college and point you in the right direction if you have questions. You know, I've had personal relationships with professors, by doing these extra activities, to be able to say, oh, okay, well, this might be something that you're interested in beyond what I'm showing you,
I care.

So it makes you just, when you see your peers around, like, hey, how are you doing? You know, did you do good on that test? Or you want to make sure that your peers are, that you guys are all on the same page, and if somebody doesn't understand, you be like you don't get it, all right, let me show you real fast. And that happens to have effect I think in my lab class for A&P because it's smaller, because we're more together, and we're at like tables, you know, like this size. We had a project together so my partner, he didn't understand something so I didn't want to move on. Everybody else from our table got up and left, but I didn't want to leave until he understood it because I felt like it was, if we're a group, we're supposed to stick together.
I can keep learning.

Yeah. I think, I mean I learned that I like to really pursue something. If I am posed a question, and they ask me, well, okay, research this topic, you're going to write about it. I write about it, complete my assignment, but I found something within that that there was this unanswered question and I really want to make something of it. Having the opportunity to pursue that really helped me learn that I don't want to give up on something just because my assignment is done, and, you know, my curiosity is what is going to keep me going from now until whenever next graduation I have umpteen years from now, but you know, it's helped me learn that I do have that level of, you know, my, I'm inquisitive enough to keep pursuing what I really want to do.
Making Assessment Your Own

- Incorporation of direct assessment of learning
- Consideration of outcomes related to students’ sense of self and connection to community
- Identification of barriers and obstacles for inclusion and success at the institutional level
- Equity Scorecard

“If we teach today’s students as we taught yesterday’s, we rob them of tomorrow.”
— John Dewey
Additional Resources

Me: finley@aacu.org


Bringing Theory to Practice: http://www.aacu.org/bringing_theory/index.cfm

VALUE Rubrics: http://www.aacu.org/value/index.cfm